

ADAMHS Workforce Data Survey General Findings Report

Submitted by:



Rice
Education
Consulting
RESOURCES FOR TRANSFORMATIONAL LEARNING

Introduction

Rice Education Consulting (REdCon) created a workforce data survey to analyze the Alcohol, Drug Addiction, and Mental Health Services (ADAMHS) Board of Cuyahoga County's provider networks' current workforce and staffing data. The primary purposes of the workforce survey is to help ADAMHS:

1. Understand each agency's workforce, staffing, and demographic data in comparison to the Northeast labor market.
2. Understand any recruiting and talent opportunities that may present barriers for ADAMHS.

Additional usage of the data include:

- Identifying racial disparities between practitioners and individuals served.
- Identifying recommendations for improvement in talent and recruitment.

Methodology

Using SurveyMonkey, REdCon developed a forty-question survey. The questions were separated into the following five categories:

1. Workforce
2. Recruiting and Talent
3. Benefits
4. Staff and Client Demographics
5. Digital Tools and Artificial Intelligence (AI)



Insights and Recommendations

The following section provides a summary of the data insights (separated by category) from the workforce survey and recommendations based on data analysis.

Workforce

Salaries

The average salary for the provider network is \$43,054.90, which is 17% higher than the County's average of \$36,702¹. ADAMHS provider network's average salary is also higher than the State's average of \$35,119¹. Although average salaries are higher than State and County averages, this information is not specifically indicative of the clinical and credential jobs within the network (e.g., nurses, physicians, and therapists). Employers in healthcare industries experience high attrition rates due to various reasons including lack of competitive compensation. It is recommended to take a deeper dive into the network's salaries by conducting compensation surveys to gather salary data on all clinical and credential jobs. This data will help identify disparities and advocate for improved compensation policies or other incentives such as bonuses, professional development opportunities, or additional paid time off (PTO).

Military Status

Over 95% of survey responses shared that their military or veteran employee population is less than 5%. In 2020, Cuyahoga County had a veteran population of 7.1% (about 70,000 veterans)² which was the highest of any county in the State of Ohio. Of those 70,000 veterans, 73% participate in the workforce². *Therefore, there is an opportunity for agencies to diversify their workforce via targeted veteran recruitment.*

Age

50% of the provider networks' workforce is between the ages of 36 – 45 (often referred to as Gen Y or Millennials), and 32% are between the ages of 46 – 55 (often referred to as Gen X). The US Bureau of Labor Statistics projects that by 2025, the US workforce will be comprised of an estimated 27% of Generation Z (born between 1997 and 2012) employees¹. As the age demographics change over the next several years, considerations should be made on how the provider network can prepare for this generational shift with an inclusive lens. *Suggested actions should include reviewing compensation and benefit offerings, developing target marketing and recruitment efforts, encouraging cross-generational collaboration between employees, and ensuring inclusive policies that attract Generation Z employees.*

Example of policies deemed attractive by Generation Z include:

- **Flexible Working:** Policies for teleworking, alternative working schedules, and flexible work weeks prioritize work/life balance. Generation Z values flexibility in work/life balance.

- **Mental Health Support:** Policies include employee assistance programs, access to digital health apps, mental health days, and stipends for mental health services.
- **Continued Education and Professional Development:** Policies promoting professional and personal growth opportunities such as tuition reimbursement, professional development stipends, and certification renewal.
- **Benefits:** Update or consider offering benefits packages that include fitness reimbursements, parental care, genetic and preventative care screenings, and telemedicine support. Generation Z values overall well-being and preventative care.
- **Internal Career Growth:** Transparent policies and procedures that outline career growth and promotion opportunities.

Tenure

Tenure is an employee's total time working at a specific employer. The average tenure for the provider network is 4 – 6 years, which aligns with the US average of 4.2 years¹.

Turnover

The ADAMHS provider network turnover rate is significantly higher (15%)³ than the Northeast labor market (9%). Generally, an average turnover rate should be around 10% (including regrettable turnover)¹. *As an opportunity to improve retention, each provider should examine their separation details, including exit interview data and engagement surveys, to understand why employees leave and to develop strategies to lower the turnover rate.*

Recruiting and Talent

Job Vacancies

81% of the provider network have job openings. These openings are separated into two categories: Clinical and Professional. Currently, there are 209 clinical openings with Case Manager, Housing Specialist, and Registered Nurse being the top three vacant job roles. Additionally, there are 119 professional job openings with Peer Support Specialist, Custodian, and Patient Access Specialist having the most openings. Currently, In Cuyahoga County, 20.2% of the total labor market work in clinical roles and 6.3% work in professional³. If this trends continues, the labor market for professional roles may not meet the current needs of the provider network (given that majority of vacancies are professional roles). *As a recommendation, provider networks may need to leverage internships, co-ops, apprenticeships, or other pipeline-generating efforts to fill the labor gap.*

Professional and Certification Needs

From the survey, post-secondary degrees, social work, counseling, and nursing certifications make up most workforce needs for the provider network. In 2021, 30% of the workforce in Cuyahoga County represents those with post-secondary degrees and certifications³. A labor gap could emerge as the provider network's need for degrees and certifications increases above what is available in the region.

Developing recruiting pipeline strategies or enlisting community engagement support to upskill the labor market may be required to keep up with the labor demands. The main goals of a recruiting pipeline strategy are to increase the quality and quantity of hires for a particular role and to reduce the time it takes to fill a role when it becomes vacant.

Examples of recruiting pipeline strategies:

- **Employee Development Programs:** Providing opportunities for current employees to advance their skills increases employee engagement and allows the employer to build their specific labor and talent needs.
- **Internships:** Partnering with local universities, including HBCUs (Historically Black Colleges and Universities) and technical schools, may provide the opportunity to diversify talent pools and develop relationships with students who can potentially fill future roles.
- **Apprenticeship Programs:** Traditionally, apprenticeships are in the construction and mechanical trade sectors. However, over the last several years, apprenticeship programs (and funding to support them) have branched to healthcare, tech, and social service roles. Becoming a state-registered apprenticeship sponsor provides another way to upskill the workforce.
- **Digital Recruiting Software:** Use digital recruiting software to continuously engage with passive and active job seekers.

Job Advertising

Currently, 100% of the provider network use Indeed, 75% use LinkedIn, and 68% use social media to advertise job openings. Currently only 31% of the network uses professional job boards. Professional job boards are job platforms that connect candidates to a specific industry or profession. They increase exposure to the attended professional network and allow exposure to a diverse pool of candidates. *Given the network's need for specific clinical certifications, providers should consider utilizing targeted professional job boards.*

A few examples of targeted job boards are listed below:

- **Healthcareers.com:** This website is a job board tailored to healthcare professions. It also offers various career resources.
- **Engage! Cleveland:** This site helps young professionals and emerging leaders connect with countless opportunities in the Cleveland area.
- **Local Chamber Job Boards:** The Northeast Ohio Hispanic Chamber of Commerce offers a community job board.
- **National Black MBA Association (NBMBA):** The NBMBA's mission "is to lead in the creation of educational, wealth-building, and growth opportunities for those historically underrepresented throughout their careers as students, entrepreneurs, and professionals." There is a Cleveland Chapter job board accessible to member and non-member job seekers.
- **OneTen:** OneTen is a national network for Black talent, Employers, Talent Developers, and Community partners dedicated to training and hiring Black talent into family-sustaining

careers. Cleveland is one of OneTen's essential markets, and the Cleveland Clinic is a key partner⁴.

Internships and Co-ops

Internships and co-ops are a great strategy to upskill the workforce and create potential pipelines for roles. Currently, over 80% of the provider network offers internships.

Benefits

It is essential to establish benefits packages and other policies that accommodate the diversity of the workforce. Benefits packages and policies that are accommodating help build inclusivity and employee engagement. For example, packages may include medical coverage options for lower-earning employees, expanded preventative care screenings, and advanced mental health resources for marginalized groups⁵. Below are a list of identified benefits to drive inclusivity and attraction from current and perspective employees. To better understand the specific needs of employees within the network, we recommend holding roundtables and/or other listening sessions with employees. The insights gathered from these sessions should be used as the basis for appropriate benefit packages.

Health and wellness

Health and wellness continue to be driving factors for employees and potential candidates. Flexible and competitive benefit offerings also play an important factor in employee engagement and organizational culture. According to the Mercer's 2022 benefit survey data, the top benefits valued by employees are employer-sponsored medical plans (67%), life insurance (45%), and mandatory paid time off (31%)⁵. Currently, 88% of the network agencies offer medical coverage, 90% offer a life insurance plan, and 58% offer paid time off.

Women's maternal and reproductive health

Women's maternal and reproductive health are critical societal concerns and can lead to social disparities. The survey captured that 4.3% of providers offer childcare or adoption services, and only 39% offer wellness benefits. *With over 50% of the Provider network identifying as female, determining maternal and reproductive health services that fit the workforce's needs can help increase retention and a sense of belonging.* Consider policies around family planning, time off, postpartum, and caregiving.

Telework

The Mercer survey captured that telework benefits are significant in an applicant's search for employment⁵. Due to the various job titles and essential job functions within the network, teleworking may not be an option for all. However, there are other ways employers can offer flexibility in the workplace, including a flexible work schedule, childcare assistance, and a newer benefit known as commuter perks which are currently being offered by 21% the network. Commuter benefits are employee perks that help your team offset the cost or time of commuting to and from work daily. These benefits are also known as transportation benefits, parking benefits, or employee transit benefits⁸.

Professional Development

Professional development opportunities are another viable strategy for recruitment and retention. 36% of the provider network offers tuition reimbursement. Providers can use tuition reimbursement to help staff secure desired professional certifications as well as to gain commitment and engagement from employees.

Digital Tools and Artificial Intelligence

80% of the provider network uses an Electronic Health Record or Electronic Medical Record, 45% use a digital tool or AI within client care services, and 25% use a digital tool or AI as an employer tool. These figures suggest that there is a significant opportunity for the network to increase its utilization of digital tools. Today, digital tools and AI are being used to build employee engagement and address accessibility opportunities, promoting an inclusive working environment. The cost of these tools vary; however, providers should explore available tools such as [monday.com](https://www.monday.com) that can be utilized at discounted rates for non-profit organizations. As more digital tools and AI emerge in every industry, the early adoption of these tools can help each provider become more efficient, identify resources, and provide data to drive decisions. *To support the adoption of these tools, there should be an education component focusing on the benefits and potential uses of digital software and other AI tools. Additionally, discussions should be held to explore ways to provide access and funding for the more expensive digital software and other AI tools.*

Staff and Client Demographics

Gender

ADAMHS provider network clients represent the broader patient population in the State of Ohio with only a 1 – 3 percentage point difference⁶.

ADAMHS provider network staff is predominantly female (67%). *This presents an opportunity for ADAMHS to diversify its workforce to achieve gender census parity (50/50)*⁷. Diversifying gender representation will help the network become more representative of both their clients and Cuyahoga County overall.

Ethnicity

Cuyahoga County's Hispanic and Latinx patient population (6.9%) is 2.5 times greater than the broader patient population in Ohio (2.7%)⁷. ADAMHS clients reflect the County at 7.2% Hispanic or Latinx. However, only 5.1% of the ADAMHS provider network staff identify as Hispanic or Latinx. There is an opportunity to diversify the workforce to be more representative of both their Hispanic and Latinx clients and the overall Cuyahoga County patient population.

Race

Black or African American is the highest-represented racial minority group for ADAMHS staff and client populations. Both ADAMHS clients and staff present significantly higher representation of Black or African American persons (41%) compared to the broader Ohio patient population (22.5%)⁶ and Cuyahoga County (30.5%)⁷. As a result, the provider network has an opportunity to

diversify the workforce to be more representative of populations that identify as Asian or having two or more race classifications. Currently, only 5.7% of staff identify as Asian or having two or more race classifications.

Summary of Recommendations

- Develop a recruitment strategy that focuses on diversifying the racial, gender, ethnic, and military personnel makeup of the provider network.
- Encourage cross-generational collaboration between employees to present educational opportunities and foster inclusion as Generation Z enters the workforce.
- Complete a deeper dive into each provider's staff turnover. Review exit interviews and other offboarding data to understand the high turnover rate.
- Establish a talent pipeline strategy or succession plan to develop talent for hard-to-fill clinical and professional roles. Work with community partners to upskill the local labor market to fit hiring needs.
- Utilize professional job boards to target specific certifications, degrees, and ethnic groups.
- Review current employee benefit offerings. Update or establish new policies and benefits that attract talent and accommodate diverse work groups.
- Build upon current professional development and tuition reimbursement policies to increase employee engagement and upskill the workforce.
- Support the utilization of digital tools and AI with education such as awareness training on its inclusivity, and its positive impact on employee and client experience.

Conclusion

The data from the workforce survey provides insightful context into each provider's demographic, talent, and workforce data. When analyzed and compared with the Northeast labor market this information can and should be used to attract top talent, build inclusive policies and support a culture of belonging. We believe that with intentionality, commitment and data driven strategies the ADAMHS provider network can be model of inclusion and access.

Notes

¹Bureau of Labor Statistics, 2022

²Ohio Department Jobs and Family Service Ohio Labor market information, 2020

³Ohio Economic Report, Cuyahoga County, 2021

⁴OneTen, Cleveland Clinic Case Study, 2023

⁵MercerBenefits Health Survey, 2022

⁶Ohio Mental Health National Outcome Measures, 2020

⁷US Census Bureau, American Community Survey, 2021

⁸ <https://www.peoplekeep.com/blog/what-are-commuter-benefits>